

Research Billing Audits: It's (almost) all in the planning?

Kelly Willenberg, DBA, RN, CHRC, CHC, CCRP  
Kelly Willenberg & Associates

Wendy S. Portier, MSN, RN, CHC, CHRC, CCM  
Kelly Willenberg & Associates

KW 1

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

2 Disclaimer

- No legal advice is provided.
- Please seek legal representation to have your questions clarified or discussed.
- The information, thoughts and opinions provided here are not legal advice: consult your institution's legal, compliance and other appropriate leaders and, at their discretion, your local Medicare Administrative Contractor (MAC), for any specific billing questions or issues

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



KW 3

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Objectives

- Understand how to **plan and prepare** to perform a research billing audit including **document concordance** review processes
- **Review claims** against the coverage analysis and the billing rules including Medicare Advantage
- Identify useful **data to capture** during a research billing audit for analysis, calculating error rates, overpayments, and underpayments

4

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Clinical Trial Coverage & Billing Compliance Primary Rules\*

1995 Medicare's Device Clinical Trial Coverage

2000 Medicare Clinical Trial NCD 310.1 (MA Device Coverage Mandate)

2007 Medicare "Clinical Trial Policy" (CTP) NCD 310.1 (reconsideration)

2014 ACA Commercial Payer Clinical Trial Mandate

**State Laws** – Clinical trial coverage laws or cooperative agreements  
**Medicaid** – Coverage depends on state Medicaid programs  
**Medicare** – Claims processing rules  
**False Claims Act** - Protects federal taxpayers from overpayment for services provided  
*\*Other laws, regulations, rules also are relevant but are largely captured by 310.1 and claims requirements*

5

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Foundation of Clinical Trial Coverage

- **Medicare – “Clinical Trial Policy”** National Coverage Determination 310.1
  - Medicare may cover the routine costs of qualifying clinical trials, if the routine costs are:
    - NOT paid for by the sponsor
    - NOT promised free in the **informed consent form**
    - Covered by Medicare
  - **Routine costs:**
    - Conventional care
    - Detection, prevention, & treatment of complications
    - Administration of investigational item
  - **All other Medicare rules apply!**

Industry Standard: Coverage determined through a Coverage Analysis (CA)!

6

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



10

### What Does It Take to Get Clinical Trial Billing Compliance Right?

- A broad understanding of many fragmented, disconnected processes and systems
- An appreciate of many events that take place before and after billing
- Correctly debiting a study account and billing a third party (insurance, patient, etc.)
- Four main reasons for incorrect billing:
  1. Technological error
  2. Human error
  3. Training
  4. Awareness

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

11

### Areas to watch in research billing and finance

- Inadequate financial accounting
- **Research subjects not identified**
- **Document non-concordances:** Protocol, Coverage Analysis, Budget, Contract, ICF
- **Charge capture/billing** for research related services and routine costs, study drugs and devices
- No monitoring of billing inquiries
- Poor budget process, lack of proper accounting and invoicing to Sponsors
- Claims lack proper **research coding:** dx, modifiers, CCs, and NCT # on claim
- **Charge segregation** occurring between research and payer or Medicare and Medicare Advantage
- Communication on **denials management** not thorough or lack of attention to detail



KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

12

### Research billing audit goals

**Although there are many nuances, and scope depends upon specific institutional goals, in a nutshell:**

- Identify system or human **error in research billing**
- Make **repayments** if overpayments are found, following required timelines
- Identify **underpayments** and invoice/bill as possible
- **Correct** process errors or gaps
- **Educate** users as applicable
- Conduct **follow-up review** to assure sufficient remediation
- Document **quality assurance** diligence

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

13

### Clinical Trial Billing & Coverage Risks

- Billing for services paid for by the **sponsor**
- Billing for services promised **free in the informed consent form**
- **Identifying subjects** enrolled in the study and reviewing claims
- Keeping up with **amendments**
- **Denial of coverage** and lost revenue

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Auditing Approaches and Processes Including Claims and Denials Review

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

15

### Before Audit can be Planned, Identify Standards

- Audits are designed to track and evaluate **existing processes** and their results
- In order to identify **audit scope**, need to have evaluated the potential failure of existing process(es) to provide intended results: **risk assessment** of entire process
- In order to evaluate existing processes, need to compare to **minimum necessary to achieve compliance** assurance: regulations, other external requirements, and organizational policies

*What does clinical research billing compliance assurance require?*

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

16

### Types of Clinical Trial Billing Audits

- Process / Internal Control
- Study Level
  - Document Concordance
  - Coverage Analysis Validation
  - Invoicing
- Subject Level
  - Claims
  - Denials
  - Invoicing

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

17

### Audit scope: preliminaries

**Stakeholders and auditors, internal and external**

- Depends upon the **content scope**
- **Skill set** to be parallel to content: e.g., denials review requires person with denials experience
- Do **internal audit or compliance departments** have authority?
- Is Office of General Counsel to be consulted?
- Decision to go external may be related to risk assessment results



KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

18

### Audit scope: preliminaries, 1

**Time span**

- Are you auditing a **process improvement**?
- Do you want to see **before and after** or just after?
- Are you performing it **for cause** and need a specific time point?

**Sample size**

- Determining **significant sample**
- Unless reviewing a process only, number of **studies**?
- If conducting billing review, number of **patients**, number of **claims**?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

19

**Audit scope: preliminaries, 2**

**Interviewees, assistants and notifications**

- o Depends upon the content scope
- o Will involve those according to assigned operational tasks
- o **Leadership channels** to be considered

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

20

**Audit Scope: One or All of the Following**

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

21

**Audit scope: one or all of the following, 1**

**Coverage analysis**

- o Is the **coverage analysis concordant** with study documents? (protocol, ICF, budget, contract, coverage analysis)
- o Does the study **qualify** for billing?
- o Do the justifications support billing the subject's insurance?
- o Were all costs included?

**Document concordance**

- o Are all study **documents concordant**? (protocol, ICF, budget, contract, coverage analysis)
- o Do study documents contain **clear language**?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

22

Audit scope: one or all of the following, 2

**Subject identification**

- Are the **subjects identified** "flagged" in the systems?
- Was the "flag" applied timely?

**Claims review**

- Did the claim go to the **appropriate payer?** (Medicare, Medicare Advantage, Sponsor, Commercial Insurance, etc.)
- Does the claim contain **correct coding?** (Z00.6, Q1, Q0, CC30, IDE#, Rev Code 256/624, NCT#, etc.)
- Does the medical record **documentation support medical necessity?**

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

23

Audit scope: one or all of the following, 3

**Payer selection**

- Audit **Medicare/Medicaid** only or include **commercial payers?**
- If commercial payers to be included, do you want
  - A different **sample size?**
  - A **subset** of them?

**Invoicing**

- Did invoicing occur?
- Was invoicing **timely?**
- Was the **proper amount billed?**
- Was **overhead** included?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

24

Audit scope: one or all of the following, 4

**Denials**

- Are research related **denials identified?**
- **What causes** research related denials?
- **Who manages** research denials?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

25

### Areas to Understand Prior to Audit Testing

- Operations
  - Charge Segregation
  - Registration
  - Charge Capture
  - Billing
- Compliance Management
  - Investigations & Monitoring
  - Training
- Financial Management
  - Budgeting, Pricing, Contracting
  - Accounts Receivable
  - Professional Fees
- Personnel
  - Roles & Responsibilities
  - Communication

KW *What areas at your organizations do you understand fully?*

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

26

### Summary: how to audit a clinical trial, 1

- Take the **standard steps**:
  - Risk assessment
  - **Objectives**: what are we trying to achieve?
  - **Scope**: what and who are to be included in the audit?
  - **Approval(s)** required: Identify necessary authorities, advisors, stakeholders
- Create an **audit plan**
  - What is the objective of each step?
  - Does the step tie to the overall audit objective?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

27

### Summary: how to audit a clinical trial, 2

- Conduct **sample selection**
- Request and **review documents**
  - Study Level – protocol / study documents, ICF, CTA, budget, CA, IND/IDE
  - Patient Level – UBs/1500s, EOBs, study accounts, subject calendars, EMR
- Perform **interviews and testing**
  - Documentation
  - Work papers
  - Data collection
- Write a report

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



Document Concordance Auditing




---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

29

Term alert: document concordance

*We use "document concordance" to refer to a key and complex practical requirement in research billing: the consistency and accuracy of all study-initiation and continuation documents relevant to billing for protocol-specified clinical services*

*Without concordance, accurate billing is impossible (- or accidental)*




---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

30

Example: document concordance and content review

Compare **key documents**

- Contract
- Budgets (Internal and External)
- Informed Consent Form (ICF)
- Coverage Analysis
- Protocol

Are there any **discrepancies** between the documents?  
 Were there any discrepancies on the Coverage Analysis?  
 Did the budget contain **invoiceable items**?  
 Were there any additional **regulatory issues** identified?

- Did the contract or ICF contain language that violate the Medicare Secondary Payer Rule?
- Did the ICF contract Medicare Advantage language for drug trials?




---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



34

### Billing grid/claim Exercise

What's missing/incorrect? S = Sponsor Paid  
M = Medicare/ 3<sup>rd</sup> Party Payer

Blue = billing grid; orange = payer claim

Procedure/Event	CPT/HCPCS Codes	Billing Designation
CT Scan Abd/Pelvis w/ Contrast incl RECIST	74177	S
CMP	80053	S
Chemo Admin	96413	M
Chemo Study Drug	J9999	S
Charge Description	CPT/HCPCS Code	Charge Amount
CT Scan Abd/Pelvis w/ Contrast	74177	\$5000.00
CT Contrast	Q9967	\$150.00
Port Draw	36591	\$200.00
CMP	80053	\$100.00
Chemo Admin	96413	\$500.00

What if Medicare Advantage was the payer?

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Data Collection & Error Rates

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

36

### Data collection during a claims review audit

**General**

- Subject identifier
- Payer Type – Primary, Secondary and Tertiary
- Visit #, DOS

**Claim Information**

- Claim type
- Encounter Number
- Claim Number
- Item / Service Description
- CPT/HCPCS Codes
- Coding: NCT#, Modifiers, Dx code, ICD9, CC 30, CCS3

**Documentation requirements**

Amount billed and amount paid

Overpayments / Underpayments

- Calculate overpayments
- Calculate underpayments
- Calculate error rates



KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

37

### CMS Error Rate Data – A/B MACs

Improper Payment Rate Scores/Rankings:

- o 1 0.0% - 3.9% (Oh Yeah!)
- o 2 4.0% - 7.9% (Getting Better)
- o 3 8.0% - 11.9% (Tighten Up)
- o 4 12.0% - 15.9% (Processes?)
- o 5 16.0% and above (Uh-OH!)

Source:

- o <https://www.cms.gov/Research-Statistics-Data-and-Systems/Monitoring-Programs/Medicare-FFS-Compliance-Programs/CERI/MedicareFFSJurisdictionErrorRateContributionData.html>

*Focused monitoring and corrective actions help organizations get to an acceptable ranking*

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

38

### Error Rate Calculations - Examples

**Payment Error Rate**

- Total dollars paid in error / total dollars paid
- EX: \$195,000 / \$500,000 = 39% payment error rate

**Claim Error Rate**

- Total # of claims billed to the incorrect payer / Total # of claims reviewed
- EX: 90 / 500 = 18% claim error rate

**Line Item Error Rate**

- Total # of line items billed to incorrect payer / Total # of line items reviewed
- EX: 975 / 5000 = 20% line item error rate

**Coding Error Rate**

- Total # of claims billed to correct payer, incorrect coding / Total # of claims reviewed. Coding errors count as 1 error per claim.
- EX: 200 / 500 = 40% coding error rate

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Common findings

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

40

Auditing clinical trial billing and finance:  
common findings, 1

- Non-employed physician group **not notified of clinical trial / subject**
- **Under budgeting**
- **Lack of fund** accounting
- **Excessive residual** balances and no residual funds policy
- **Claims submission errors**
  - Misdirection of charges – **double billing**
  - **Denials**
    - For example: pre-authorization, investigational article
  - **Coding errors** and mismatches
    - IDE, NCT numbers on claim no CC or Q-modifiers
    - IV administration with no study drug on claim
  - **No follow-up** on denials; write-offs

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

41

Auditing clinical trial billing and finance:  
common findings, 2

- **Charges not posted** in billing systems
- Billing of professional (pro) and technical (tech) **charges not coordinated**. For example, pro charge is billed:
  - to insurance and tech charge is billed to sponsor/research
  - to Medicare and tech charge is billing to Medicare Advantage
  - with clinical trial coding but the tech charge lacks coding
- **“Off the books”** research activities
- **Patient reimbursements** held or not paid

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

42

Contact Us

Wendy Portier, MSN, RN, CHRC, CHC, CCM  
Consultant  
Kelly Willenberg and Associates, LLC  
[wendy@kellywillenberg.com](mailto:wendy@kellywillenberg.com)  
504-782-1328





Kelly Willenberg, DBA, MBA, BSN, CHRC, CHC, CCRP  
Owner, Kelly Willenberg and Associates, LLC  
P 864.473.7209  
[kelly@kellywillenberg.com](mailto:kelly@kellywillenberg.com)

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

43

# Appendices

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

44

### Summary: Medicare requirements – drug trials

Claim Type	Coding Requirements	Location on Claim
Technical UB-04 (CMS1450)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Z00.6 – Secondary Diagnosis</li> <li>- Modifier Q0 &amp; Q1 as needed (Outpatient Only)                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Q0 – Investigational Clinical Service (Drug)</li> <li>- Q1 – Routine Costs</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Condition Code 30 “Qualifying Clinical Trial”</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Field 66</li> <li>- Field 44</li> <li>- Field 18 - 28</li> <li>- Field 42</li> <li>- Field 39; D4 &amp; Value Code = 8 digit NCT#</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Rev Code 256 – Drug Trial</li> <li>- NCT # (<a href="http://www.clinicaltrials.gov">www.clinicaltrials.gov</a>)</li> </ul>	
Professional CMS1500	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Z00.6 – Secondary Diagnosis</li> <li>- Modifier Q0 &amp; Q1 as needed                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Q0 – Investigational Clinical Service</li> <li>- Q1 – Routine Costs</li> </ul> </li> <li>- NCT # (<a href="http://www.clinicaltrials.gov">www.clinicaltrials.gov</a>)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Field 21</li> <li>- Field 24.D – Modifier</li> <li>- Field 19 (Use CT pre-fix on paper claim only)</li> </ul>

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

45

### Summary: Medicare requirements – device trials

Claim Type	Coding Requirements	Location on Claim
Technical UB-04 (CMS1450)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Z00.6 – Secondary Diagnosis</li> <li>- Modifier Q0 &amp; Q1 (Outpatient Only)                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Q0 – Investigational Clinical Service (Procedure)</li> <li>- Q1 – Routine Costs</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Condition Code 30 “Qualifying Clinical Trial”</li> <li>- Condition Code 53 – Free Devices (Outpatient only)</li> <li>- NCT # (<a href="http://www.clinicaltrials.gov">www.clinicaltrials.gov</a>)</li> <li>- Value Code F0 (Free Device as part of a trial, Outpatient Only)</li> <li>- Rev Code 0624 – Device Trial                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Device charge – list as non-covered (token) charge if device is provided at no cost</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Rev Code 278 – Medical/Surgical Supplies: Other Implants</li> <li>- IDE Number</li> <li>- Category B IDE device HCPCS code, as applicable</li> <li>- Generally, Category A is not reported on institutional claim. Follow Medicare’s specific instructions for the trial</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Field 66</li> <li>- Field 44</li> <li>- Field 18 - 28</li> <li>- Field 18 - 28</li> <li>- Field 39; D4 &amp; Value Code = 8 digit NCT#</li> <li>- Field 39; Credit amount for device</li> <li>- Field 42</li> <li>- Field 47 &amp; 48</li> <li>- Field 42</li> <li>- Field 43</li> <li>- Field 44</li> </ul>
Professional CMS1500	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Z00.6 – Secondary Diagnosis</li> <li>- Modifier Q0 &amp; Q1 as needed                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Q0 – Investigational Clinical Service (Procedure)</li> <li>- Q1 – Routine Costs</li> </ul> </li> <li>- NCT # (<a href="http://www.clinicaltrials.gov">www.clinicaltrials.gov</a>)</li> <li>- IDE Number</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Field 21</li> <li>- Field 24.D – Modifier</li> <li>- Field 19; Use CT pre-fix on paper claim only</li> <li>- Field 23</li> </ul>

KW

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Medicare Q&A 2014

Mandatory Reporting of NCT# Identifier on Medicare Claims\*

Medicare coverage of clinical trials, prospective studies, and registries			
	CTP	IDE	CED
<b>CMS approval required</b>	No – must qualify under NCD 310.1	Yes –each specific study approved by FDA before 11/2015, requires MAC approval; for each specific study approved by FDA after 11/2015, requires CMS approval	Yes – requires CMS approval for each specific study
<b>Public notification</b>	No – provider determines qualification	Each specific study approved by FDA after 11/2015 appears on CMS IDE Website	Each specific study approved by CMS appears on CMS IDE Website
<b>Routine services (Q1)</b>	Covered if otherwise coverable by Medicare in qualified study	Covered if study is approved by CMS and otherwise coverable by Medicare	Covered if study is approved by CMS and otherwise coverable by Medicare
<b>Investigational item/service (Q9)</b>	Covered if otherwise coverable by Medicare in qualified study	Covered if study is Category B, and approved by CMS	Covered if study is approved by CMS

\*<https://www.cms.gov/Medicare/Coverage/Coverage-with-Evidence-Development/Downloads/Mandatory-Clinical-Trial-Identifier-Number-QA.pdf>

KW

---



---



---



---



---



---



---